# In Place & Time

# FEDERICA GOFFI Carleton University

The many stuffs -matter, energy, waves, phenomena - that worlds are made of are made along with the world. But made from what? Not from `nothing, after all, but from other worlds. Worldmaking as we know it always starts from worlds already on hand; the making is a remaking.

- Nelson Goodman, "Ways of Worldmaking"

Architectural conservation is a form of invention and imagination concerned with the dilemma of how to maintain a building's identity while allowing changes over time. Questioning the nature of architectural conservation beyond our dominant western understanding as a practice of preservation 'as is', or restoration 'as was' is key in understanding change as a design issue.

In contemporary perception, architecture and conservation appear disjointed. Conservation is born like Eve out of architecture's body. Preservation defined itself, as a legitimate concern for the conservation of historic buildings, unproblematically replaced *in toto* with modernist *instant buildings*, regardless of historicized, cultural and geographical context.<sup>1</sup> At the same time, an orthodox application of basic conservation principles significantly limits the possibility for creative interventions onto a wide spectrum of historic buildings, from 'mnemic buildings' to "unexceptional buildings", denying a possibility for change in adapting to varying conditions pertaining to their use.<sup>2</sup>

Norwegian Architect Sverre Fehn (1924-2009) poignantly observed that: "The religion of the present day is the denial of death. So, objects are not allowed to die either, but are preserved. Ruins should not be ruined further, but should keep their present condition to the end of the world. If you go to a museum today you will see that every object made of iron is covered and enormous sums of money are spent on ventilation systems for the sake of preservation. Nothing should fall into pieces or die."<sup>3</sup> Historic buildings are "not allowed to die" or change, but rather are treated as museum objects, based on the assumption that material preservation *as-is*, is a necessary and sufficient condition for a preservation of essence.

#### MNEMIC ARCHITECTURE

The idea of adding, subtracting and altering an existing building is well received within the context of contemporary adaptive reuse. Altering industrial sites for the purpose of retaining history, while sustaining our built environment in adapting to new necessities, is now a well-established practice. When the building in question though is a 'mnemic building', of recognized heritage value, alterations are viewed with suspicion, even when change is a recognized necessity. This is of course a reasonable preoccupation. Such in fact is a building that has entered, and been part of, the collective imagination of a place since time immemorial; its presence is so pervasive that any change would be perceived as a loss of identity.

A 'mnemic building' is perceived as having been there since a time that extends beyond the reach of memory. Actual beginning and mythical narrative intertwine so that myth, sedimented within the history of a place, informing its collective imagination, takes precedence over truth, when the two appear to point in different directions. The collective imagination of a place is sustained through the making and multiplication of images and narratives, informing a sense of proprioception, and providing a city with a collective body image. Mnemic is a persistent or recurrent effect of something experienced. A collective body image can be so powerfully pervasive that if a mnemic building is lost through a traumatic and sudden event it could provoke a phantom limb effect.

# **BODY IMAGE AND MEMORY**

The collapse of Venice's belltower in 1902, due to structural failure might serve as a paradigmatic example. The bell tower has been, since time immemorial, a key iconographic feature defining the recognizeability of the city. The immediate response after the collapse, was to rebuild it "as was", and "where it was", restoring a deeply sedimented body image.<sup>4</sup> A city's body image is fabricated through the proliferation of drawings, prints, navigational maps, yesterday's pilgrims guides and today's tourist guides, photographs and postcards, viewcards and souvenirs, etc. from various periods, which become essential in defining a self-image of a place within the collective memory and imagination.<sup>5</sup>

This is not unlike what might have been experienced by citizens of New York in 2001 with the collapse of the 'Twin Towers' due to a tragic and sudden terrorist attack, which has gone down in history as 9/11. Yet the response was very different. An ealry representation of their former presence was achieved by projecting two bodies of light, which made them once again part of New York's city skiline, re-presencing them through a new form and materiality, symbolic of a transformed essence. The results of a competition (2003) that was held to rebuild the towers, and won by Daniel Libeskind, envisioned not the restoration of the former body image, but a re-making which entailes change.<sup>6</sup>

Because of the envisioned changes to New York's sedimented body image the event will not be forgotten; only a restoration of the city's image would possibly allow for this tragic event to fall into oblivion, which is what happened with Venice's tower, where most people today are not aware that the present tower is not the first one; having rebuilt it exactly *as was* and *where it was*. A former body image known to all was perpetuated and restored, rejoining past and present as an unchanged continuum, making change unperceivable. Is it always necessary to restore a body image? A 1902 postcard portraying a photographic montage, presents Venice's bell tower reconstructed as was, but not where it was, provocatively asking that question (fig. 1). The postcard's author proposes to create a duplicate of the object, suggesting that it might be possible to imagine it being rebuilt in a different location, so that it would not obstruct the view of St. Mark's Basilica from the plaza, ironically questioning whether improvements could be made.<sup>7</sup>

The objective of our inquiry into the notion of remaking mnemic buildings however is not a provocation, but rather, it is seeks to define a meaningful alternative cosmologic paradigm of a rejoined theory and practice of architectural-conservation, when strict necessity causes us to question the future of such a building. What in fact seems to be conspicuously lacking is a theoretical framework to help us question the issue of change as a possible creative endeavor, when a mnemic building is concerned, entailing conservation of memory within changes.

Are there other ways to re-imagine the future of a mnemic building, besides restoration of a body image *as was*, or preservation *as is*? Can we entertain the notion that a building might be significantly altered and yet maintain its identity? Can we learn and adapt to a new body image and if so, how? Is it possible to conceive of conservation as a form of invention allowing for the making of memory through the unfolding of time, revealing the possibility for an imagination of conservation?

Clearly each building is born under a certain set of contingencies, which are set in place and time, defining a specific astrology at birth, and need to be evaluated individually, rather than being subjected to a predefined generalized philosophical approach to conservation. Inquiring into questions such as what is the Time-matter at hand in the making of a building, would remain an essential question in each specific case. Growing concerns, which are now expressed towards the survival of modernist instant buildings, created out of the mode of being without history, will require specific answers. Instant buildings might reject any theory of change as a way of achieving conservation, prompting as is preservation answers, which might disregard whether this would be, or would not be, a sustainable approach to conservation.8

If a mnemic building is to resemble memory, one has to question which kind of memory are we talking about? <sup>9</sup> In a mnemic building/drawing every physical location precisely corresponds to a memory location, thus allowing for remembrance by maintaining an exact correspondence between the two.<sup>10</sup>

In current western conservation theory, when physical changes are required, identity is questioned. When improvements are needed, they are as far as possible, performed in a mimetic way, equating the preservation of exterior likeness to a preservation of essence, spending significant resources to freeze a single 'Time-slice'.<sup>11</sup> As a result of this approach, when a mnemic building undergoes change, visual reconstruction often seems to be the only possible viatic to resurrect identity.



Figure 1: Postcard, 1903. Photographic montage of Venice's bell tower. © *Il campanile di San Marco*, 1992

# CURRENT NOTIONS OF PRESERVATION AND RESTORATION

Western Modern and Contemporary notions of preservation imply 'slowing down Time' and the related aging effects, to preserve objects of interest unaltered or, alternatively, they propose a process of 'reversing Time' to recreate a preexisting condition without conjectures, based on supporting evidence, and in this case it is referred to as restoration.<sup>12</sup> Preservation is defined by contemporary standards as a "measure to protect and stabilize", while any alteration in the form of additions to an existing building is not considered part of the scope of such intervention. An orthodox application of these principles might at times work against the very principles; a building which is not allowed to reasonably, and meaningfully adapt to the requisites of a new use, might fail in sustaining its own existence.

Restoration, according to contemporary standards, attempts to unravel history, going back to a previous 'Time-slice', which is then frozen and artificially separated from a time-continuum, to recapture a previous appearance.<sup>13</sup> Reconstruction is done based on accurate evidence, in the hope that this would support a flawless reconstruction. Current standards and guidelines do not envision a method of approaching the question of change, when particular circumstances might compel for it.<sup>14</sup>

A building once produced, after a 50-year period, enters the realm of the historic and is no longer treated as a design-object, but as a history-object. A disjunction between past and present, conservation and architecture runs along this 50-year 'dead-line', where an artificial threshold is drawn. In this contemporary view history is separate from the present. The right to alter such fabrics no longer belongs to a present generation and the most appropriate approach suggested is stewardship, interpreted as a form of curatorial management of the built world.<sup>15</sup>

Questioning the nature of architectural conservation implies the necessity of critically defining a meaningful approach to creative change, which is not advocated as a way of forgetting but as a way of meaningfully remembering.

# THE LESSON OF CARLO SCARPA

The lesson of modern Venetian architect, master of time in architecture, Carlo Scarpa (1906-1978), embodied in projects such as Castelvecchio in Verona and the Querini Stampalia in Venice, to cite two of his projects, has not yet impacted the writing of conservation standards, or informed a significant revision of current Western conceptions of this notion. Scarpa's way of approaching mnemic architecture, which could be defined as a palimpsest always in-the-making, has yet to be acknowledged as the soul of new conservation strategies. Scarpa pointed out the lack of imagination and the problem of falsehood inherently embedded in restoration strategies. This criticism is still largely unacknowledged by those claiming authenticity, in their making of architectural copies.<sup>16</sup>

French philosopher Henry Bergson (1859-1941) stated that "we could not live over again a single moment, for we should have to begin by effacing the memory of all that has followed". His notion of duration might inspire a new understanding of conservation, if embracing Time-as-continuity of before and after. 17 "There is no doubt that for us time is at first identical with the continuity of our inner life. What is this continuity? That of a flow or passage, the flow not implying a thing that flows, and the passing not presupposing states through which we pass; the thing and the state are only artificially taken snapshots of the transition; and this transition, all that is naturally experienced, is duration itself." 18 Bergson, overturned the fragmentation of linear time, with the idea of an ever-changing continual process of duration.

# **INSTANT MAKING**

The current notion of architecture, inherited from the modern movement, is not mindful of duration either. Architecture has become a practice of instant making. The invention of a building seems to pertain to an instantaneous creation, hence modern buildings have no history.19 Furthermore, even though we are moved to think critically about how to sustain our environment and making the best use of present resources for future use, architects often do not view historic buildings as likely canvases for their creations, imbued as they are with a culture of instant making, nor are they allowed to do so when the building considered is protected by heritage designation. The sustainability approach offers reflections primarily focused on measurable efficiencies, and does not contribute to a broader understanding of architecture as a vessel for meaning. 20

As a consequence of an instantaneous birth, buildings are understood as the product of a singular author and epoch, rather than the product of a multiplicity of authors, reinforcing a present attitude to create out of nothing. The focus on an individual creator, rather than on multiplicity of authorship through Time, has made architecture atemporal, not apt to aging well, and therefore less sustainable. New buildings are designed for short life cycles and are no longer mnemic, and respond to a predicted life-span, based on that of various systems incorporated.<sup>21</sup> Instant buildings place themselves outside the influence of time perpetuating an original image. Is the building born in a state of perfection or is this the result of a *Dorian Gray* syndrome? Dorian's unchanging appearance did not reflect his actual persona, which was trapped in the painting; the link between body and soul was drammatically severed. Are these buildings ideal museum objects, to be preserved within a crystal sphere, like the models of the city of Fedora described by Italo Calvino in "Invisible Cities"? Architecture should be capable of sustaining itself through Time, by means of appropriate changes.<sup>22</sup>

The current notion of instant architecture also influences the way we look back. Our notion of historic buildings as instant architecture, projecting retrospectively this cosmological time-dimension, does not necessarily correspond to earlier time paradigms embodied by mnemic buildings. This might inspire restoring buildings to a single time-slice, censoring under-acknowledged layers of history.<sup>23</sup>

Vicenza's Basilica is analyzed in most architectural text books, with a few exceptions, as a single-time building, even though it is in fact a hybrid.<sup>24</sup> In 1549 Palladio reclothed on three sides a significant Middle Ages body, with a new Renaissance façade, with a double order portico. The Basilica is most often photographed focusing a viewer's attention on the Renaissance addition. This imaginative wrapping of an existing body would not have been possible under a spell of preservation *as is*. Palladio's façade came into existence through a dialogue with an historic body, defining this fabric as a building within a building.<sup>25</sup>

#### **MAKING IN TIME**

A key question is of course what kind of change is possible and appropriate at any one time, and for any one building? How can we ignite a meaningful dialogue between conservation and architecture?<sup>26</sup> The future of past and present architecture largely depends on both, a proper understanding of the concept of conservation, acknowledging an imaginative dimension to it, as well as a proper understanding of what pertains to the field of architecture, beyond the realm of instant making.

Time is an implicit design material, whose ineludible presence needs acknowledgement. Just as architec-

ture reveals time, time unfolds to reveal architecture's life. Time, the other face of change, shapes the body of buildings impacting their materiality and essence, and revealing a cross-exchange between time and architecture and a reciprocal nurturing.

By inquiring into the notion of re-making mnemic buildings, it might be possible to provide a critical look into contemporary notions of preservation, often equating likeness to essence; meanwhile also reassessing that which pertains to architecture, to include notions of architecture as palimpsest, and not just instant building. Understanding the relationship between architecture and its making-in-time, is essential to a merging of architecture and conservation into a hyphened practice of 'architectural-conservation' as a form of invention, informed by a twofold meaning of its etymological root *invenire* (Latin), which entails both to find but also to imagine.

# FACADISM AND PHOTOGRAPHIC MEMORY

Recent scholarship has pointed out the positive influence of sustainability on adaptive reuse, towards the sustenance of a fabric as a whole, beyond a mere appreciation of an exterior façade, or streetscape in the name of urban conservation. This



Figure 2: Nils Ole Lund "The city as Scenography". 37x49 1983.  $\ensuremath{\mathbb{C}}$  Collage Architecture 1990

is largely due to an acknowledged value of embodied energy. <sup>27</sup> Façadism, a widely performed practice since the early 1970's, has often resulted into a 'skin-deep' form of conservation, where a spoliafaçade, yet meaningful, often fails to be genuinely integrated.<sup>28</sup> When the conservation of a façade is used merely as a scenographic prop of history, in service of new urban development interests, the result is the upholding of a postcard of an historic city, completely erased behind it. Danish architect Nils Ole Lund (b.1930), author of "The City as Scenography" presents a poignant visual metaphor for the reduction of streetscapes to artificially propped up displays (fig. 2).<sup>29</sup>

A recent focus of architectural representation on the production of photorealistic depictions contributes to the false belief that, with design and construction, a building reaches a state of completion, corresponding to a still image, prefigured by a final likeness, unalterable by time. <sup>30</sup> The realistic enhancement of digital drawings, aiming to emulate photographic techniques, becomes the physical embodiment of the stillness of architecture.

Innovative drawing representation techniques also provoke a rethinking of a present understanding of conservation. These in fact contribute to generate the illusion that the past can be preserved, through instantaneous still-shots.

Even when agreeing with Freedberg that "all images might act *pro memoria"*, one should be careful not to elude the question of whether one-Time likeness is sufficient to define memory, and question whether this is not reducing it to an instant story without history, turning conservation into a form of still-preservation.<sup>31</sup> Electronic survey tools presently provide the field of conservation with documentation methods, of unprecedented accuracy, contributing to generate the illusion that the past can be preserved, capturing an instantaneous stillshot, thus producing images without imagination, to be preserved *as is*.<sup>32</sup>

The image in the photograph becomes a mirror par excellence; portraying what is believed to be a truthful representation of the past. Photography has from its early beginning been interpreted as a tool capable of expressing absolute truth-value, and was metaphorically described as a "mirror with a memory".<sup>33</sup> This is revealed by a case in point, an 1860's "Traveling Mirror" where a painted tintype photo of a man with a hat is used to replace a central mirror piece (fig. 3). Mirror and photography are presented in this piece as a tautology.<sup>34</sup> Interestingly, if the man in the photograph were to reflect himself in the mirror, he would naturally compare his own ever-changing presence with the tintype, a still-image of the past, instituting a dialogue with and a tension between two images of past and present appearance.



Figure 3: Traveling Mirror 1860's. Glass, wood, embossed leather, Etched and painted tintype (of a man with a hat). Unknown author (American) 28.7 x 69.0 x 1.5 cm. C Batchen 2004: 18.

# **CONTIGUOUS IMAGERY**

The practice of conservation, once a form of invention and imagination, where memory was not simply an archive for posterity, but was always inthe-making, has turned into a form of still-preservation. The belief is that a building can and should maintain a given likeness in perpetuity, in order to preserve a past heritage. The future is presently at risk of becoming a frozen past, while cities turn into museums for wandering tourists.

Orthographic photographs are presently used as mirrors for how buildings ought to look like. Photography as Roland Barthes poignantly pointed out is a "prophecy in reverse: like Cassandra, but with eyes fixed on the past". <sup>35</sup> Barthes stated that "photography is violent: not because it shows violent things but because on each occasion it fills the sight by force, and because in it nothing can be refused or transformed". Unlike the mirror mounted in Alfarano's drawing, which allows to look in two directions through a chiasmus of past and future, orthographic photography's mirror looks in one direction alone, that of the past, with a result that could be described with Roger Connah's words as a "lift(ing of) the building out of time, out of breath." <sup>36</sup> Connah states that "architecture looks likely to remain loyal to photography's naïve optical seduction longer than this disaffection ever imagined". This seduction, which separates the building from time, is the expression of a death by mono-directional sight.

'As-found' color orthographic photographs could instead become an imaginative substratum for future design representations. Alterations and additions might be made visible through layered representation techniques in the media of hybrid drawingphotographs, not unlike the one factured by Carlo Scarpa, for the design of a window facing the courtyard in Castelvecchio, Verona, where he achieved metaphoric transparency through a pen drawing onto a photographic medium, which translated in a physical overlay of new steel moldings and window frames onto historic wall openings, which allows reading in a present condition the presence of a building within a building (fig. 4).



Figure 4: Carlo Scarpa. Free hand ink drawing on photograph (1950s-'70s). Detail of a window towards the courtyard. Sketch of the new interior window moldings. C Castelvecchio Museum

Through metaphoric or literal transparency of a medium, combined with appropriate representation techniques, the past is not erased from memory, but rather ambiguously dwell within a possible future; in this rests the possibility for a resurfacing of memories, establishing a meaningful design dialogue, favoring a conservation of essence and continuity of identity.<sup>37</sup> An architectural-conservation drawing should be interpreted as a phenomenological palimpsest, like the walls of an historical city, carrying the traces of its transformations, and forming a contiguous imagery, reminding of the work of contemporary American photographer Robert Heinecken, and his 1989 Recto/Verso photograph overlays (fig. 5). <sup>38</sup> Writer James Enyeart comments on Heineken's Recto/Verso # 12. "Contiguous imagery in an artist's work is the imagination's imitation of the mind's working process. It is impossible to imagine thinking one thought at a time or completing a thought without the overlay of another. And what about sensory signals and memory? It is impossible to conceive of imagination without contiguous imagery."<sup>39</sup>

Heinecken's 'recto/verso' are the result of a particular phenomenon. The process through which the image is achieved has been described as exposing to light a piece of color photographic paper, which was placed in direct contact with a single page from a magazine. This allows for two images, in the recto and verso condition, to merge onto a new medium -the color photographic paper- realizing a contiguous imagery of past and future events, evoking the process through which memory traces overlay in the mind and imagination.



Figure 5: Robert Heinecken, 1989. Recto/Verso # 12. 11''x14'' Cibachrome photogram. © Landweber

Place is constructed over-time through the merging of multiple unfinished stories. The perception of before and after, is possible when change is visible, thus creating memory. Temporal disjunctions between an anterior and a posterior condition can be made visible through a careful articulation of joints between building members. <sup>40</sup> Time entails both continuity and succession.

Acknowledging time only as 'photographic memory' of the past, would be tantamount to compressing history to a single instantaneous still-shot. A current understanding of the past as inventory is gradually turning cites into museums, congealing our imagination of conservation, and limiting our understanding of the past to a *read-only* experience, where a real interpretation is negated, by looking in one direction only, retrospectively. Current interpretations of conservation as read-only practice, exhibiting prodigious photographic memory, provide a limited approximation of the complex secret workings of human memory and culture.

Being mindful of Kevin Lynch's admonition that "Memory cannot retain everything; if it could we would be overwhelmed with data. Memory is the result of a process of selection and of organizing what is selected so that it is within reach in expectable situations. There must also be some random accumulations to enable us to discover unexpected relationships. But serendipity is possible only when recollection is essentially a holding fast to what is meaningful and a release of what is not. To attempt to preserve all of the past would be life denying. We dispose of the physical evidence of the past for the same reason that we forget".<sup>41</sup>

Architectural-conservation allows for selective remembering and willful forgetting. The gap between architecture and conservation might be bridged, reinstating a dialogue between them, embracing a twofold look, through appropriate drawing strategies recollecting memories of the past while simultaneously looking into the future, allowing for meaningful change, rather than simply denying it.

## **ENDNOTES**

1 Two orders of issues are referred to here, one is the loss of know-how of historic construction methods and materials which leads to a chronic replacing, rather than maintenance and minimal substitution of individual components of historic buildings, this applies particularly to less durable materials such as timber structures for example; the second aspect is the actual demolition of historic buildings going back to a tabula rasa, giving rise to a condition of amnesia and placeless-ness. Nathan Silver in 'Lost New York' for example explains how the demolition of the 1906 Pennsylvania Station was due to an "application of the real estate logic that often dictates the demolition of the very building that makes an area desirable" (2000: 38). See also Jacobs's "Life and Death of Great American Cities" (1992). Further influences on the development of architectural conservation theories have been coming out of art historical studies, such as the "Restoration Theory" by Cesare Brandi (2005), essentially abducting concepts pertaining to art objects to architectural monuments, raising issues of authenticity versus counterfeit identity, which is of course linked with an idea of singular authorship. Furthermore, the destruction resulting from World War II in Europe is on the background of a raising consciousness of restoration: the destructions caused by war bombings were part of an everyday experience, the idea of restoring back to a previous condition had in many cases the role of healing wounds from this tragic historical period. In 2005 the restoration of Dresden cathedral was completed, sixty years after the end of the war, demonstrating that a slow healing process is still taking place.

2 Since the publication of the Venice Charter in 1964 "unexceptional buildings" can also be recognized as historic monuments. Florian 2006: 24-35. Fitch 1982. Page 2003. Murtagh 1997.

3 Gennaro Postiglione and Christian Norberg Schulz 1997.

The phenomenon of proprioception yields a sense of postural presence of the body, by constructing an inner "body image". Contemporary neurologist Vilayanur Ramachandran argues that it is this body image that generates the feeling of a phantom limb when an actual limb is missing, causing real feelings of pain and movement of the phantom (Ramachandran 1998). Ramachandran has been able to cure phantom pains with the use of a mirror, restoring the body image of the absent limb, which is made visible in a mirror reflection. See also: Anderson-Barns et al. 2009; http://warburg.sas.ac.uk/test/figures/postures.htm. The construction by 1499 of a false choir by Donato Bramante in Santa Maria at San Satiro in Milan is an example of phantom limb architecture. The presence of a street adjacent to the church would not allow building a choir. Bramante resorted to a three dimensional false perspective, constructed in the limited space available, allowing perceiveing the presence of a choir, when the observer is correctly positioned in the construction view point of the persectival view, which is aligned with the main axis of the church, leading to the altar.

5 Samonà et al. 1970. See also the catalogue for the exhibit held in Venice, on the one-hundred years anniversary of the collapse of the bell tower edited by Maurizio Fenzo and Alessia Bonannini (1992). The tower was restored by Luca Beltrami (1854-1933). The original appearance subtly altered to achieve a more slender profile, using new bricks together with spoil elements, and introducing the use of reinforced concrete for parts of the structure. The bombings of World War II have also caused significant losses in Europe, which gave impulse to numerous restoration projects as a result of similar phantom limb effects, some of which have only recently completed. An example is the restoration and new construction of the Carlo Felice Opera Theater in Genoa by Aldo Rossi completed in (1983-1990).

6 During the same terrorist attack in 2001, one of the wings of the Pentagon in Washington Dc was almost completely destroyed by fire, due to the impact of the airplane that was hijacked into the building. In this case the response was to rebuild it exactly *as it was, where it was* in a one-year period. This different approach might have to do with what the building symbolizes and with the fact that only a portion of it was destroyed, causing the body image not to be questioned.

7 Discussing the history of the transformations of St. Mark's square in Venice, Giuseppe Samonà (1970: 38) discusses the role of history as a judge of the quality of architecture and urban spaces, and comments of the fact that today's conservation concerns no longer allow to perform such an editing function.

8 In Urban Memory: History and Amnesia in the Modern City (2005: XX) Mark Crinson, states: "We are not so sure that memory has a place in the contemporary city and that is why it is talked about so much."

9 Halbwachs 1992. Connerton 1989. Conservation might be interpreted in very different ways in different cultures. The ritual reconstruction on alternative sites, located next to each other, of the Ise Temple in Japan, reoccurring every twenty-two years is intriguing; clearly here the focus is not on material preservation *as is* or *per se*, entailing an all together different notion of memory and identity.

10 A mnemic building shares in the workings of "artificial memory" as it is described by Francis Yates (2001) in her seminal work on the art of memory. 11 This was the case with the 2002-2005 restoration of Mies van der Rohe's Crown Hall at IIT in Chicago, which was granted the status of National Landmark in 2001. Even though the original steel structure design for the main stairs was considered inadequate based on current building codes, the required changes were hidden beyond a carefully reconstructed exterior appearance, equating likeness to essence.

The U.S. Department of the Interior's definitions 12 of Preservation, Restoration, Rehabilitation and Reconstruction, currently in use by municipalities in the U.S., relies on a philosophical approach to conservation as mono-directional gaze, oriented towards the past. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Buildings with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitation, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings, 36 CFR Part 68 in the July 12, 1995 Federal Register (Vol. 60, No. 133, ch.1). The approach is similar in Canada, United Kingdom and Italy. Rooted in theories on architecture, the first approach in contemporary notions of conservation was fathered by John Ruskin (1819-1900). An English writer of the nineteenth century, Ruskin (1989 and 1981) opposed creative change at the expense of an historic building, which, in his view, would imply altering the essence, with the result of a loss of integrity and authenticity. Restoration was fathered by French architect Eugène Emmanuel Viollet-le-Duc (1814-1879), who claimed that the notion of restoration is entirely modern. His theory of restoration involved the act of reinstating a condition of completeness inspired by a principle of "unity of style" that a building might have never reached before; essentially being an operation

that places restoration 'outside of time' altogether. This approach was developed parallel to the need for visual historical archetypes for the teaching and fabrication of history, corresponding with the French Restoration and the return of the monarchy. Architectural restoration wasused as propaganda. Restored monuments were used as props in fabricating an eloquent story, advocating the return of the monarchy (1814-1848). Viollet-le-Duc's approach is significantly different from a present understanding of restoration, in as much as the latter is guided by an intention to reconstruct exact replicas of the past, rather than imagining it. Viollet-le-Duc 1990 (1868). U.S. Department of the Interior's definitions of 13 restoration (Secretary of the Interior's Standards 1995). 14 Rehabilitation and Reconstruction, the other two approaches standardized by the U.S. document, do not consider this issue either. Rehabilitation addresses the problem of change only in connection with the necessity of defining an alternative compatible use. Reconstruction is a form of restoration, which differs only in admitting its imaginative dimension, even though its scope remains one of depicting a previous appearance of the building. One could think that alteration is equated to a loss of identity and is therefore not included within the scope of conservation.

15 For a building to be treated as historic it should be at least '50' years old. The 50-year period seems a vague reminder of the average lifespan of an individual. Instead than defining an artificial distinction between past and present, it might be possible to define a building's life in terms of continuous duration. The 50-year period now includes several modern buildings, which might challenge the notion of heritage as a form of preservation as is or as was, due to the use of modern materials and design details which, are part of their original conception, requiring significant resources to preserve a 'picture frame' of the past. See the work of Susan Ross (2008) on Canadian Modernism and the challenge posed by the conservation of modernist facades employing materials promoted by the International Style, such as reinforced concrete, and their implementation in this particular region and climate.

16 "The problem of historical materials, which we can never ignore but can't imitate directly either, is an issue that has always concerned me [...] I've had nothing but trouble from planning rules in Venice and the bureaucracies who interpret them. They order you to imitate the style of ancient windows forgetting that those windows were produced in different times by a different way of life with "windows" made of other materials in other styles and with a different way of making windows. Anyway stupid imitations of that sort always look like humbugs and that's just what they are." Carlo Scarpa cited in Murphy (1990: 4). See also Goffi 2006.

17 Current preservation theories, conversely to restoration, do advocate for a conservation of *all* timeslices; however, this very preservation of the layering as a whole, prevents a present generation from further adding. The architect approaches the past primarily as a curator, transforming conservation in stewardship. This contradicts the processes through which historic buildings have come to be, which is a sedimentation of multiple time-layers. Why is it that a further and continuous layering is now prevented? 18 Bergson 1965. 19 With the terminology of 'modern buildings' it is referred here to buildings, which have been created from scratch in the modern period. For example, the modern renovation of Castelvecchio by Carlo Scarpa would not fit into this category, because such building exhibits a stratification of interventions over time. While, buildings such as Ville Savoye by Le Corbusier, which is born out of this same time period, but from scratch, as the result of instant making, would be referred to as a modern building in this text.

ACSA 2009 Sheryl Boyle & Federica Goffi, The 20 Sustenance of Architecture, Making as Re-Making. Modern buildings, such as the Villa Savoye at 21 Poissy-sur-Seine, by Le Corbusier (1929-30), conceived as instant architecture, are to be preserved as is, requiring significant resources to sustain a past timeframe. Nicholas Pevsner, arguing in his article "Time and Le Corbusier" (1959), for the preservation of this modern villa, indavertently pointed out its inadequacy in sustaining itself through Time. In disrepair after the war, the villa was restored. The unpleasing premature decay of the building prompted Pevsner to state: "they do not make beautiful ruins, and there is no reason why they should have to, within a quarter century of their erection". He criticized government authorities, who should guarantee the conservation of this modern building. Stating that Corbusier's Villas make "bad ruins", Pevsner makes us question their ability to resonably sustain the effects of time. Ironically they do need frequent makeovers and adequate upkeep to preserve a still image of eternal whiteness! This is the result of the application of the "Law of Ripolies", which Le Corbusier created: "Whitewash is extremely moral. Suppose there were a decree requiring all rooms in Paris to be given a coat of whitewash. I maintain that that would be a police task of real stature and a manifestation of high morality, the sign of great people." (Le Corbusier 1987). The owner of the 1922 Villa at Vaucresson by Le Corbusier, added a pitched roof, to make it more sustainable, as a criticism by action of its unsustainably frequent need of maintenance. Mark Wigley (2001) explained that "white as newness" is essential to Le Corbusier, because of its associations with purity, simplicity and health. Wigley comments that "replacing the degenerate layer of decoration that lines buildings with a coat of whitewash" is the compelling moral duty envisioned by the modern master. The predicted life cycle of modernist buildings might be elongated of course, by selectively replacing aging components and upgrading them, based on current standards. This also raises the question to design new buildings with built-in life cycles for various elements and components. A special issue of Places (20:1, 2008), titled Re-Places, and guest edited by Garth Rockcastle, dealt with the life cycles of modernist buildings and issues of recalibrating their life expectancy, by redesigning individual components, such as the facade, which presented energy efficiency issues, maintaining a durable skeleton structure, while rejuvenating the exterior envelope.

22 Time is a design material with a complex threefold significance of Time-Weather-Tempo, based on the Latin etimolgy of the word. However for the purpose of this dissertation the focus is limited on the notion of time as both a philosophical concept embodied into building practice, and as weathering as a form of aging. 23 This was of course the very criticism of John Ruskin's towards notions of restoration contemporary to him (Ruskin 1989).

24 Frascari 1998.

25 This of course might raise the question as to why Palladio (1965) represented it as a complete renaissance body, portraving it as what might appear as a result of instant making in his architectural treatise. One might raise the hypothesis that while the real building is in a condition of mortal life, the treatise represents it at the end of time; how it will be for eternity after the second coming. Overlapping the actual plan and the drawn one could reveal interesting details about the design and fabrication processes. One could speculate that certain complete designs portraying a complete new plan of St. Peter's Basilica in the Vatican, might have been drawn within a similar understanding, entailing that only an addition/alteration would be taking place, even when an entirely new building had been drawn. Such would be the case with several design drawings by both Peruzzi and Sangallo, and would apply also to Michelangelo's posthumously published plans executed by Dupérac in 1569.

26 Neither instant architecture, nor conservation *as is* or *as was,* are truly sustainable from the viewpoint of the best use of present resources, for future use. Furthermore, each building should be addressed as an individual entity, for which a specific approach should be sought.

27 Kessler Mark 2009.

28 Richards 1994. Highfield 1991. There are of course exceptions. The spolia-façade of an historic building in the renovation of Utrecht's Town Hall by Enric Miralles, honestly declares the spolia-façade, making the prop-like support structure an element of design expression, which can be appreciated by passerbys.

29 Lund 1990.

30 Goffi 2007.

31 Freedberg 1996: 76.

32 Orthographic photography allows the production of exact replicas. Photographically produced orthographic drawings include elevations and roof plans. The Leica Disto<sup>™</sup> Laser Measuring provides an accuracy of 1.5 millimeters.

- 33 Draaisma 2000: 69.
- 34 Batchen 2004: 18.
- 35 Barthes 1980: 87.

Connah (2001: 44) critically points out that "though Bartes, Sontag, and Burgin shared with many the obvious suspicion of photography, none made the mistake of thinking they were photographically correct." (2001: 47). For further reflections on Barthes 'Camera Lucida' see also a series of collected essays edited by

Geoffrey Batchen (2009). 37 The transparency of certain contemporary drawing mediums, such as Mylar polyester film for

example, might be suitable for establishing a visual relationship between the preexisting building (verso) and the future building (recto). A physical transparency of the medium might allow for a multi-temporal reading of the drawing, sustaining a dialogue between past and future building, which would take place in the materiality of the support, mimicking physical alterations.

38 The 1989 *Recto/Verso* Cibachrome photograms (11"x14") are described by Landweber as "made without

the use of camera or film. A single page from a masscirculation magazine was placed in direct contact with color photographic paper and exposed to light. The resulting image superimposes the visual and verbal information from the front and back of the magazine page. No collage, manipulation, or other handwork was employed." <u>http://www.landweber.com/RectoVerso/</u> rv\_writers\_3.html (accessed on February 19, 2010). 39 http://www.landweber.com/RectoVerso/rv

39 <u>http://www.landweber.com/RectoVerso/rv</u> <u>writers 3.html</u> (accessed on February 19, 2010).

40 Oftentimes in present practice such joints articulate changes between historic and contemporary materials. Dilatation joints, allow for differentiated contraction of construction materials in relationship to temperature changes, thus affording a poetic possibility revealing the passage of time. One interesting example is offered by the dilatation joints in the Minneapolis Mill-City Museum designed by Meyer Schercher & Rockcastle for the 2005 Conversion of a flower mill.

41 Lynch's theoretical hypothesis (1976) are confirmed by contemporary British neurologist Oliver Sacks, whom comments on one of his patients, Franco Magnani, an artist, whom having vivid recollections of his past in the italian city of Pontito, experiences a state of "double consciousness", a dream state which does not allow him normal functionality in everyday life (Sacks 1992).

## Bibliography

Anderson-Barnes, V., C. McAuliffe, K. Swanberg, J. Tsao. "Phantom limb pain. A phenomenon of Proprioceptive Memory? *Medical Hypotheses*, 73, 4 (2009): 555-558.

Barthes, Roland. *Camera Lucida, Reflections on Photography*. New York: Hill & Wang, 1980.

Batchen, Geoffrey. *Forget Me Not. Photography & Remembrance*. New York: Princeton Architectural Press, 2004.

——. Photography Degree Zero: Reflections on Rholand Barthe's Camera Lucida. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2009.

Bergson, Henry. *Duration and Simultaneity: with reference to Einstein's Theory*. Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1965.

Brandi Cesare. *Theory of Restoration*. Florence: Nardini, 2005.

Connah, Roger. *How Architecture Got its Hump*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2001.

Connerton, Paul. *How Societies Remember*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.

Crinson, Mark, ed. Urban Memory: History and Amnesia in the Modern City. London: Routledge, 2005.

Draaisma, Douwe. *Metaphors of Memory, A History of Ideas about the Mind*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press. 2000.

Fenzo, Maurizio and Alessia Bonannini. *Il campanile di San Marco. Il crollo e le ricostruzione. 14 luglio 1902-25 aprile 1912*. Milano: Silvana Editoriale, 1992.

Fitch, James Marston. *Historic Preservation, Curatorial Management of the Built World*. Charlottsville, VA: University of Virginia Press, 1990.

Florian, Urban. "From Periodical Obsolescence to Eternal Preservation." Future Anterior 3, 1 (2006): 24-35.

Frascari, Marco. "The Silent Architect and the Unutterable Nature of Architecture." In *The Culture of Silence: Architecture's Fifth Dimension*, edited by Malcolm Quantrill and Bruce Webb. College Station, Texas: A&M University Press, 1998.

Freedberg, David. Holy Images and Other Images. In *The Art of Interpreting. Papers in Art History from The Pennsylvania State University*, edited by Susan C. Scott. University Park, Pennsylvania: The Pennsylvania State University, 1996 (68-87).

Goffi, Federica. "Carlo Scarpa and the Eternal Canvas of Silence". ARQ 10, 3-4 (2006): 291-300.

——. 'Architecture's twinned Body: Building and drawing'. In *From Models to Drawing*, edited by Marco Frascari, Jonathan Hale, Bradley Starkey. London: Routledge 2007.

Lynch, Kevin. *What time is this place*? Cambridge: Mit Press, 1976.

Halbwachs, Maurice. *On collective Memory.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992.

Highfield, David. *The Construction of New Buildings Behind Historic Facades*. New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1991.

Jacobs, Jane. *The Death and Life of Great American Cities*. New York: Vintage, 1992.

Kessler Mark. Sowing Seeds of Diversity: The Influence of Sustainability on Adaptive Reuse. ACSA proceedings. Portland 2009: 510-517.

Le Corbusier. *The Decorative Art Today*, translated by James Dunnett. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1987.

Lund, Nils-Ole and Christian Olmsen. *Collage Architecture*. Berlin: Ernst, 1990.

Murtagh, William. *Keeping Time: The History and Theory of Preservation in America.* Hoboken N.J.: Wiley John & Sons, 1997.

Murphy, Richard. *Carlo Scarpa and the Castelvecchio.* London: Butterworth Architecture, 1990.

Palladio, Andrea. *Descritione de le chiese, Stationi, Indulgenze & Reliquie de Corpi Sancti, che sonno in la Citta de Roma*. Vicenza: C.I.S.A., 2000 (1554). Page, Max. *Giving Preservation a History*. New York: Routledge 2003.

Pevsner, Nikolaus. "Time and Le Corbusier". Architectural Review 125, 746 (March 1959): 159-165.

Postiglione, Gennaro and Christian Norberg Schulz. *Sverre Fehn*. New York: The Monacelli Press, 1997.

Ramachandran, Vilayanur S. and Sandra Blakeslee. Phantoms in the Brain: Probing the Mysteries of the Human Mind. New York: Harper Perennial, 1999.

Richards, Jonathan. *Façadism*. London: Routledge, 1994.

Rockcastle, Garth. "Why Re-Place?" Places 20, 1 (2008): 4-9.

Ross, Susan. "How Green was Canadian Modernism? How Sustainable will it Be?" *Docomomo* 38 (March 2008): 67-71.

Ruskin, John. The Stones of Venice. London: Faber & Faber, 1981 (1851-53).

——. *The seven lamps of architecture.* New York: Dover Publications, 1989 (1848).

Sacks, Oliver. *The Man who Mistook his Wife for a Hat*. London: Gerald Duckworth, 1986.

Samona, Giuseppe et al. *Piazza San Marco, l'Architettura, la Storia, le Funzioni*. Venezia: Marsilo Editore, 1970.

Silver, Nathan. Lost New York. New York: Mariner Books 2000.

Viollet-le-Duc, Eugene Emmanuel. *The foundations of Architecture: Selections from the Dictionnaire Raisonne 1868.* Reprint, with an introduction by Barry Bergdoll, translated by Kenneth D. Whitehead. New York: George Braziller, 1990.

Wigley, Mark. White Walls, Designer Dresses. The Fashioning of Modern Architecture. Cambridge: MIT Press, 2001.

Yates, Frances. *The Art of Memory*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001 (1966).